Crossing Boundaries
Hybridity, Migration and the Development of Pilgrimage in Multicultural England

John Eade

1. The interweaving of global and local – the fragmented field of pilgrimage studies

This colloquium comes at an opportune time for what might be called ‘pilgrimage studies’.1 We have moved a long way from the debates about communitas and contestation which influenced research during the 1980s and early 1990s towards other issues and themes, such as gender, ethnicity, mobility, performativity, material culture, landscape, healing, globalization, transnationalism, shared shrines, and the various modes of alternative and non-religious pilgrimage.2

Two key moves within the Anglophone academic sphere have informed this diversification of pilgrimage research – the mobility and the spatial turn. Both turns have informed the on-going debate concerning the important pilgrim / tourist binary and Simon Coleman and I engaged with them through our Reframing Pilgrimage volume.3 The two turns have also informed more general discussions of religion, which are very helpful to pilgrimage studies. Thomas Tweed’s theorization of religion, for example, has fruitfully employed the concepts of pilgrimage research – the mobility and the spatial turn. Both turns have informed the on-going debate concerning the important pilgrim / tourist binary and Simon Coleman and I engaged with them through our Reframing Pilgrimage volume.3 The two turns have also informed more general discussions of religion, which are very helpful to pilgrimage studies. Thomas Tweed’s theorization of religion, for example, has fruitfully employed the concept of pilgrimage

---

1 The substantive sections of this paper were largely published in J. EADE: ‘Identitarian pilgrimage and multicultural society’, in A. PAZOS (ed.): Pilgrims and pilgrimages as peace-makers in Christianity, Judaism and Islam (Farnham, UK and Burlington, VT 2013) 105-117.
3 COLEMAN & EADE: Reframing pilgrimage.
cepts of dwelling and crossing, while Kim Knott has drawn on the spatial turn and Henri Lefebvre’s work in particular through her analysis of the location of religion.4

Yet, we must be careful not to overemphasize the progress which pilgrimage research has made. The liquid modernity celebrated by Zygmunt Bauman is not much in evidence when it comes to the global flow of information, ideas and people involved in research on pilgrimage! The field is dominated by scholars working in Western Europe and North America, who publish their work in Anglophone journals and books. Even these scholars are divided by the Atlantic – they mainly work within their particular region, rarely meet together or refer to research undertaken in the other region. The field is further fragmented by national academic traditions and language barriers so that in Europe, for example, a central network has emerged among scholars from different countries who can communicate in English – as this colloquium demonstrates – and those writing in various non-English mediums.

Disciplinary traditions further fragment the European field with those working in the dominant disciplines of social and cultural anthropology, religious studies, cultural geography and history rarely engaging with those trained within the ethnology and folk studies traditions of Central and Eastern Europe. These gaps and obstacles are even more pronounced when it comes to communication between researchers operating in different regions of the globe as Ian Reader has persistently pointed out.5

2. Global flows and transnationalism

These academic networks and divisions cannot be understood simply in intellectual terms. They have been influenced by crucial political and economic changes around the globe. Structural approaches towards western secular modernity were undermined by their failure to explain adequately what was going on in the wider world – decolonization, the collapse of Communism, transnational migration, and single-issue campaigns against various forms of (racial, ethnic, gender, sexual) inequality, global migration, transnational networks and the global resurgence of religion in the public sphere. To understand these changes academics spoke of multiple modernities, hybridity, third spaces, scapes, spheres, new ethnicities, diasporas, and a variety of ‘posts’: post-socialism, post-nationalism, post-multiculturalism, post-secularism, etc. Across Western Europe research programs, institutes and centers have been created through national and European Union funding to examine these complex net-

works, emergent forms and boundaries. For example, between 2004 and 2011 I was academic director of a research center which worked across disciplines and European countries to understand these developments in the context of nationalism, ethnicity and multiculturalism. Over the last five years I have returned to the study of pilgrimage and have discovered in the process surprising overlaps between migration, cultural diversity and pilgrimage within the European region. This paper will reflect on these overlaps by applying the concept of hybridity, which has been used in the analysis of new minorities created by global migration and transnational networks, to an analysis of developments within pilgrimage.

3. Cultural hybridity, new ethnicity, diasporas and transnational networks

During the 1990s the settlement of migrants from the Global South and the Balkans in West Europe led to a range of concepts designed to capture the new social and cultural formations emerging predominantly in urban areas. These concepts were driven by British and American academics in particular. Hybridity was coined to reflect the mixtures produced through interaction between the newcomers and the 'indigenous' population which challenged narratives concerning 'pure', indigenous traditions. The construction of national imagined communities was complicated by the new ethnicities emerging from the process of translation between different cultural traditions. Stuart Hall urged scholars to move away from a focus on bounded identities to explore the dynamic process of identification.

What emerged as 'everyday multiculturalism' rather than top-down multicultural policies reflected a variety of movements and the intersection of multiple identities, where minorities were connected to their countries of origin even as they settled in their countries of destination. Here I want to explore these developments in two extents: the application of the hybridity concept to capture the increasing complexity of beliefs and practices beyond the sphere of conventional religion in Europe and North America (3.1) and the emerging study of new forms of pilgrimage created by minorities (3.2).

---

3.1. Applying hybridity to analyze the increasing complexity of belief and practice

I want to draw on a very enlightening paper by Philo, Cadman and Lea where they review the debate about ‘new spiritualities’ associated with New Age developments since the 1960s.7 New spiritualities are an example of the tendency towards mixing different symbolic and material elements which scholars have noted in other contexts, e.g. the cultural mixtures or ‘new ethnicities’ generated by minorities in British cities. Hybridity defies the either/or binary logic which elites use to defend religious boundaries so that ‘Catholic Jews’, for example, are considered problematic ‘since the seeming purity of one identity (say, Catholic) is “contaminated” by the ideas-and-conducts associated with another (say, Jewish).’8 Their approach towards identity, hybridity and boundaries reflects, in other words, the ways in which the ‘construct of the sovereign, autonomous, self-possessed human subject has come under fire (...) in the social sciences and humanities’.9

Their approach can also be understood in terms of an important development which is beginning to make itself felt in pilgrimage research – the rejection of the representational perspective which dominated the social science field between the 1970s and 1990s. This questioning is particularly suggestive in terms of the popular distinction between nature and society, where Rob Shields, Tim Ingold and Nigel Thrift, in particular, have challenged the dominant representational approach.10 Lynn Ross-Bryant in a recent analysis of pilgrimage in the context of American national parks,11 draws on their phenomenological-hermeneutic approach to challenge conventional binaries between sacred / profane, nature / culture, subject / object, individual / community to explore ‘the many different threads that weave together to make up an experience’.12 She argues that we need to avoid both labelling ‘some things part of the pilgrimage experience and others outside of it’ and encourages us to explore ‘unexpected elements that would otherwise be ignored as irrelevant’.13

---

12 Ross-Bryant: Pilgrimage to the national parks 13.
13 Ross-Bryant: Pilgrimage to the national parks 13-14.
CROSSING BOUNDARIES

The non-representational exploration of fluidity and the hybridities created through these interactions has also been usefully explored by Hume, Ivakhiv and Holloway in religious geography.\(^{14}\) Huffa and Stallins draw on their insights to analyze the relationship between religious and non-religious space in an urban development for conservative Catholics in Florida.\(^{15}\) They characterize this ‘religicity’ as a hybrid which spans ‘the spectrum from religious to non-religious space’ and suggests ‘that the difference between officially sacred space and other space is best understood not as a static binary, but as a dynamic gradient’. They also draw on the suggestion by Dodge and Kitchin\(^{16}\) that the ‘constant making anew of a domain in reiterative and transformative practices’ can be understood in terms of ontogenesis – a process of ‘continually bringing into existence’, as opposed to ontological that is simply ‘that which exists’.\(^{17}\)

In the domain of pilgrimage the increasing popularity of the *camino* has encouraged researchers to draw on these and other post-modern approaches. As Paul Post and others have noted, the *camino* is a fine example of how a pilgrimage route can be open to all kinds of people and meanings. In a recent discussion of walking practices along the route Doi draws on the French philosopher Deleuze, to understand ‘pilgrims’ bodily movements and their environment. She seeks to avoid a holistic approach by interpreting these movements as ‘fractal-like’ things, i.e. those which ‘are observable sporadically in various activities and are not a reduced-sized copy of the whole’.\(^{18}\)

The possibilities for various kinds of conjunctures during walking is also explored by Jason Danely in his study of pilgrimage in Tokyo. He approaches the phenomenon ‘as a way of inhabiting social engagement through a cultivation of aesthetic practice’.\(^{19}\) Pilgrimage constantly exceeds the dominant interpretive models ‘through its indexical transposability, or its wandering off to other meaningful paths’.\(^{20}\) Pilgrimage needs to be unbound\(^{21}\) so that we can unde-
stand the fluidity and 'playful possibilities that animate the connections between pilgrim and pilgrimage in lived experience'.

3.2. Migration and new pilgrimages: multicultural England
3.2.1. Catholic pilgrimage
To put these general developments concerning hybridity and fluidity into the context of specific nation-states I will focus on what is now one of Western Europe's most culturally diverse countries – Britain. Here pilgrimage went into steep decline during sixteenth century Reformation with the wholesale closure of shrines in monasteries, convents, cathedrals, churches and isolated areas of the countryside. Some pilgrimage activity survived, especially in areas where there was a strong recusant population or in out of the way rural localities. Pilgrimage revival was also encouraged by the mass migration of Irish Catholics from the 1840s and the re-establishment of the Catholic hierarchy in 1850. Church leaders encouraged the revival of old shrines and the emergence of new ones as a form of evangelization among a highly illiterate, impoverished urban populace whose spiritual life frequently bore the hallmarks of folk beliefs and practices rather than conventional church observances.

Illustrations 1-2: Anglican and Catholic Pilgrimage, Walsingham

During the twentieth century pilgrimage shrines continued to increase as Catholic priests in particular showed considerable entrepreneurial skills in seizing opportunities to link famous European shrines to local needs. A copy of the grotto at Lourdes, for example, was built by unemployed miners during the 1920s at Carfin, Scotland, so that local Catholics could be involved in the cult even if they could not travel to Lourdes itself. Pilgrimages undertaken by members of the Established Church – the Church of England – also began to develop. The most celebrated example is the Marian shrine at Great Walsingham in East Anglia, which was revived in 1931 through the efforts of ‘High Church’

21 DUBISCH: In a different place; READER: ‘Pilgrimage growth in the modern world’.
22 DANELY: Watching and walking 3.
clergy but also saw the emergence of Catholic pilgrimage to the Slipper Chapel outside the village [see Illustrations 1 and 2]. After the Second World War pilgrimages have not only expanded further but also attracted in some cases a multicultural audience. The Marian shrine at Aylesford near the Anglican cathedral at Canterbury was developed during the late 1940s by the Catholic order of Carmelites and Poles, who had fought in the war and chose to remain in Britain, established two pilgrimages there [see Illustration 3] and other minorities began to come to the shrine so that celebrations are now held by Tamils, Goans, Keralans, Nigerians, African-Caribbeans, Italians and Portuguese. At Walsingham the Orthodox Church also became involved by establishing a chapel in the Anglican shrine when it was built in 1931 and then converting a former railway station nearby into a chapel in 1967.

Illustration 3: Aylesford and Polish Migration

Pilgrimage since the end of the Second World War has been intimately bound up with the expansion of tourism and widening range of opportunities for travel, especially with the growth of jet-powered flight, the massive increase in car ownership and an ever-enlarging cohort of retired people. These developments have benefitted local as well as national and international pilgrimage centers. Local shrines have attracted those who wish to make a day trip, frequently on a weekend. More recently the rapid growth of virtual communications, especially the internet, has enabled representatives of local shrines to spread the word and their websites are sometimes supported by local or regional tourism agencies.
Hence, an enquiry for Marian shrines in England through an internet search engine such as Google reveals the presence of eighteen sites across the country.

Illustration 4-5: Our Lady of Willesden, Catholic Church and Statue

Three of these are based in London and Our Lady of Willesden, located in the parish church of a predominantly working class, highly multicultural area of West London [see Illustration 4], attracted 312,416 visitors from 178 countries despite being far from the tourist hotspots of Westminster where the other two were to be found. The Marian cult was revived in 1892 when a new statue of Our Lady was blessed by the Catholic Archbishop of Westminster and in 1954 the shrine ‘was made the center of Westminster’s celebrations for the Marian Year and throughout 1954 some 60,000 pilgrims visited the shrine’ [see Illustration 5]. Another reason why pilgrims continued to visit the shrine appears to have been its association with the founder of Opus Dei – St Josemaría Escrivá – who visited Willesden in 1958 and 1962.

3.2.2. Pilgrimage among non-Christian religions – Hindus

Pilgrimage in England reflects, therefore, the development of cultural diversity generated by the Irish Catholic immigration and the relationship between the minority Roman Catholic Church and the nation’s Established Church – the Church of England. This cultural diversity increased with the onset of immigration from former colonial territories after the Second World War and the emergence of non-Christian pilgrimage cults.

Although evidence about non-Christian pilgrimage activity is limited, academic research is growing. While most pilgrims still go on pilgrimage to their countries of origin, especially India, or in case of hajj to Mecca and Medina, shrines are beginning to emerge in Britain and local places are being refashioned to reflect the growing multicultural diversity of England in particular. The ground has been laid for non-Christian pilgrimage to emerge by the regular visits of holy men from South Asia in particular, which were financed by their devotees in Britain. These visits also attracted potential converts, who could bring professional and linguistic expertise, as well as knowledge of the locality.
Hindus have played the most part in this development. As early as the 1980s there was evidence of Hindus going on local pilgrimage, viz. the study of a Satya Sai Baba pilgrimage by Bowen. One of the most prominent shrines was established in a substantial mock-Tudor house north of London by ISKCON (the International Society for Krishna Consciousness), which had attracted many white British converts [see Illustration 6]. During the 1960s ISKCON has moved much closer to local Hindu practices. The Bhaktivedanta Manor’s reputation for miracle was linked to its emergence as a pilgrimage center. However, the presence of what many inhabitants nearby regarded as an exotic intrusion into the English countryside did not go unchallenged. During a planning dispute over the use of the site ISKCON had to call on all its connections with local and national political elites to prevent the shrine from being closed down.

The controversial presence of Hindu shrines in English localities and their engagement with local and global constituencies was also demonstrated in another controversy involving another Hindu shrine. The Community of the Many Names of God was formed in London during the 1950s but in 1973 it moved to Skanda Vale in the Welsh countryside [see Illustration 7].

Its website describes monastery as including ‘both monks and nuns who take Franciscan vows of poverty, chastity and obedience, as well as some resident lay members’ and providing ‘spiritual refreshment to a large number of devotees living both in Britain and abroad’. The monastery supported a farm where in 2007 one of its bulls became sick and a government department requested that the animal be put down [see Illustration 8]. The monks challenged the official request, which was supported by the National Union and local government officials, and drew on their wide range of support with people coming from

Switzerland and New Zealand. They also used the internet to make the dispute an international one. The bull was eventually taken away for slaughter but the controversy highlighted the interweaving of different interests and principles operating at local and more global levels, such as the role of the state, European law, pressure groups, the sacred role of animals, the sanctity of life within Hinduism and the desecration of a sacred place.

Illustration 9: Ganesh Ceremony, Liverpool

While these two examples highlight the role of particular shrines, Hindu tradition insists that the sacred can emerge anywhere. This was demonstrated in an emergent ceremony held at an apparently unlikely place – Merseyside. In 2007 Liverpool, whose port once welcomed ships from far and wide, especially North America, greeted Hindu pilgrims for the ceremonial immersion of an effigy of the elephant god, Ganesh [see Illustration 9]. The event organizer claimed that the River Mersey was ‘worshipped by British Hindus as their own Holy River Ganges’27 but the celebration brought together not only pilgrims from cities across England but also local religious and secular leaders in a celebration of the nation’s multicultural policies and practices.

The development of Hindu pilgrimage involved not just the shaping of physical sacred space but also the growth of virtual sacred space through the use of the internet. As an increasing number of virtual devotional sites spring up, Nesbitt speaks of an emerging ‘global Hindu identity’, ‘cyberdarshan’ and ‘recreating sacred geography in cyberspace’ which is transforming the way Hinduism is practiced in India and abroad. She argues that “[w]hile Hinduism’s roots are ancient, the web is providing a new platform to unite a diaspora, relay a sacred image and go on pilgrimage from the comfort of a home computer”.28 She points to a concomitant shift in authority associated with sacred space: “[w]hile pundits and priests transmitted religious identity in the past, software engineers and computer programmers are responsible for most of today’s devotional sites”.29 Nesbitt detects30 a movement towards homogenised, ‘catholic’, ‘ecumenical’ places of worship and the emergence and legitimation of distinctive sub-groups associated with particular regions of India and specific gods and gurus, such as (in the West Midlands) Baba Balak Nath. The establishment of more and more impressive mandirs looks set to coincide with the individualisation of religion that the internet facilitates – cyber Hindus in Hindu cybercommunities.

3.2.3. Pilgrimage among non-Christian religions – Muslims

Pilgrimage has usually been discussed in terms of the many European Muslims who go on hajj. Yet Sufi brotherhoods are active across Western Europe and shrines are appearing so that the familiar activity of *ziyarat* is beginning to develop outside the traditional world of Muslims sacred space. Ballard notes, for example, that:31

As ethnic colonies rapidly expanded in both scale and sophistication, not only have more or less full-time *pirs* begun to emerge in the UK, but following their deaths (of which there have been relatively few so far) their devotees have begun to transform their tombs into ever more fully-fledged shrines.

The establishment of *pirs* and *mazars* in Northern England and the Midlands led to the emergence of a shrine described by Williams during the late 1980s.32

30 NESBITT: ‘Locating British Hindus’ sacred space’ 23.
CROSSING BOUNDARIES

In a person’s home in ‘an East Midlands city’, the birthday of the Prophet Muhammad was celebrated by devotees, who paid their respects to a relic – the preserved hair of the Prophet. Morgahi has also been studying a Sufi shrine, which contains the tomb of a ‘religious scholar’, who has become a ‘spiritual saint’, rather than a descendant or representative of a Sufi order.33 [see Illustration 10] Pilgrims come from far and wide, including The Netherlands and Denmark. They contribute to the shrine’s different constituency compared with the traditional shrines – ‘youth followers and converts’ – and a ‘more intellectual than spiritual’ approach [see Illustration 11]. As Morgahi notes, ‘[t]hese transformations hint at the changes in patterns of religious authority in the context of diaspora’.34 The devotions reflect these changes since they are an eclectic mix of Sufi rituals derived from different Sufi tariga or orders thus marking shifts in the ritual practices of the urz while the holders of the shrine follow a naqshbandi Sufi order, the actual celebration of the event exhibited a mix of Sufi and popular Islamic practices.

Illustration 10-II: Muslim Shrine, English Midlands

Like British Hindus, Muslims are also encouraged to engage with sacred virtual space through internet sites and virtual communication. While they may identify with both a global Islam (umma) and local cults, the growth of cyber Islam also supports the individualization of religion through people’s ability to ‘pick and mix’. These mixtures of global and local, universal and particular, physical and virtual space are also encouraged by the interweaving of Sufi and Western music, which are popular among many British Muslims within the second and third generation.

34 MORGahi: ‘Pilgrimage to a shrine’ 8.
35 MORGahi: ‘Pilgrimage to a shrine’ 8.
4. Conclusion

This paper has explored the ways in which migration across territorial boundaries has shaped the development of pilgrimage in England since the nineteenth century, especially after the Second World War. The increase in cultural diversity created by this migration has been studied in terms of hybridity and this concept has been helpful in understanding the increasing complexity of beliefs and practices associated with new spiritualities. In terms of pilgrimage we have seen how multiculturalism in post-war England has been intimately associated with the growth of non-Christian cults. British Hindus and Muslims, for example, are not only going on pilgrimage to their countries of origin or to Mecca and Medina but some are also involved in developing pilgrimage centers in Britain’s towns and countryside. These activities are contributing to the sacralization of the nation’s urban and rural landscape which has largely been studied in terms of urban place-making through the (sometimes contested) building of mosques, churches and temples and public processions.

The paper has focused on Britain but the issues it deals with are relevant, of course, to the wider European context. The relationship between migration and urban sacralization has been examined in other European nations, but it seems that the role of pilgrimage has attracted scant attention. Perhaps we will discover over the next few years the extent to which this gap is generated by different approaches towards migration and cultural diversity in other European countries and/or a lack of academic interest.

Prof. dr. John Eade, PhD London, is professor in Sociology and Anthropology, University of Roehampton and visiting professor, University College London.
E-mail: J.Eade@roehampton.ac.uk

38 See, for example, the special issue of Journal of ethnic and migration studies 31/6 (2005) 1015-1083 and the introduction by J. Cesari: ‘Mosque conflicts in European cities. Introduction’, in Ibidem 1015-1024.